Gluonic Transversity from lattice QCD



Phiala Shanahan, MIT

- Past 60+ years: detailed view of quark structure of nucleons
- Gluonic structure (beyond gluon density) relatively unexplored
- Electron-Ion Collider
- Priority in 2015 long range plan
- "Understanding the glue that binds us all"
- What can LQCD do to help?



Cover image from EIC whitepaper arXiv::1212.1701



Lattice QCD for the EIC

Electron-Ion Collider

Precision gluon structure Timescale~ 2025



Lattice QCD

Gluonic observables challenging! Few results so far:

- Gluon momentum fraction
 [Meyer&Negele; Gockeler et al.; Yang et al.]
- Gluon contribution to helicity
 [Liu et al, Alexandru et al.]



phikal tepresentation Xof 1508p00901 spin

7/18/16

EIC Lecture 1 at NNPSS 2016 at MIT 28

What does a proton look like?



Bag Model: Gluon field distribution is wider than the fast moving quarks. Gluon radius > Charge Radius

Constituent Quark Model: Gluons and sea quarks hide inside massive quarks. Gluon radius ~ Charge Radius

Lattice Gauge theory (with slow moving quarks), gluons more concentrated inside the quarks:

Gluon radius < Charge Radius

Studying gluonic structure of hadrons/nuclei is hard

- Gluon probed only indirectly in electron scattering from hadrons/nuclei (does not couple to photon)
- Other processes less clean: heavy flavour production

Studying gluonic structure of hadrons/nuclei is hard

- Gluon probed only indirectly in electron scattering from hadrons/nuclei (does not couple to photon)
- Other processes less clean: heavy flavour production
- Quarks and gluons mix via evolution
 - Uniquely quarky: nonsinglet quantities
 - Uniquely gluonic: double helicity flip/ gluonic transversity

Studying gluonic structure of hadrons/nuclei is hard

- Gluon probed only indirectly in electron scattering from hadrons/nuclei (does not couple to photon)
- Other processes less clean: heavy flavour production
- Quarks and gluons mix via evolution
 - Uniquely quarky: nonsinglet quantities
 - Oniquely gluonic: double helicity flip/ gluonic transversity

Gluonic Transversity

Double helicity flip structure function $\Delta(x,Q^2)$

- Purely gluonic observable
- Well-defined
- Hadrons: Gluonic Transversity
- Nuclei: Exotic Glue
 - gluons not associated with individual nucleons in nucleus
 - operator in nucleon = 0 operator in nucleus \neq 0



 $\langle p | \mathcal{O} | p \rangle = 0$ $\langle N, Z | \mathcal{O} | N, Z \rangle \neq 0$

Gluonic Transversity

Double helicity flip structure function $\Delta(x,Q^2)$

- Purely gluonic observable
- Well-defined
- Hadrons: Gluonic Transversity
- Nuclei: Exotic Glue
 - gluons not associated with individual nucleons in nucleus
 - operator in nucleon = 0 operator in nucleus \neq 0



 $\langle p | \mathcal{O} | p \rangle = 0$ $\langle N, Z | \mathcal{O} | N, Z \rangle \neq 0$

Targets with $J \ge I$ have leading twist gluon parton distribution $\Delta(x,Q^2)$: double helicity flip [Jaffe & Manohar 1989]

- Unambiguously gluonic: no analogous quark PDF at twist-2
- Vanishes in nucleon: measure of exotic glue in nuclei
- Experimentally measurable
 - Nitrogen target: JLab Lol 2015 [J. Maxwell]
 - Polarised nuclei at EIC [R. Milner]
- Moments calculable in LQCD



Hadronic tensor for inelastic lepton scattering from a polarized spin-one target:

$$W_{\mu\nu}^{\Delta=2} = \frac{1}{2} \left\{ \left[\left(E_{\mu}^{\prime*} - \frac{q \cdot E^{\prime*}}{\kappa\nu} \left(p_{\mu} - \frac{M^2}{\nu} q_{\mu} \right) \right) \left(E_{\nu} - \frac{q \cdot E}{\kappa\nu} \left(p_{\nu} - \frac{M^2}{\nu} q_{\nu} \right) \right) + (\mu \leftrightarrow \nu) \right] \right\}$$
$$- \left[g_{\mu\nu} - \frac{q_{\mu}q_{\nu}}{q^2} + \frac{q^2}{\kappa\nu^2} \left(p_{\mu} - \frac{\nu}{q^2} q_{\mu} \right) \left(p_{\nu} - \frac{\nu}{q^2} q_{\nu} \right) \right] \left[E^{\prime*} \cdot E + \frac{M^2}{\kappa\nu^2} q \cdot E^{\prime*} q \cdot E \right] \right\}$$
$$\Delta(x, Q^2)$$



Hadronic tensor for inelastic lepton scattering from a polarized spin-one target:



Measurable in unpolarised electron DIS on transversely polarised target as azimuthal variation

Nitrogen target: JLab Lol 2015 [J. Maxwell]

Polarised nuclei at EIC [R. Milner]



Measurable in unpolarised electron DIS on transversely polarised target as azimuthal variation

Nitrogen target: JLab Lol 2015 [J. Maxwell]

Polarised nuclei at EIC [R. Milner]

Parton model interpretation

$$\Delta(x,Q^2) = -\frac{\alpha_s(Q^2)}{2\pi} \text{Tr} Q^2 x^2 \int_x^1 \frac{dy}{y^3} \left[g_{\hat{x}}(y,Q^2) - g_{\hat{y}}(x,Q^2) \right]$$

 $g_{\hat{x},\hat{y}}(y,Q^2)$: probability of finding a gluon with momentum fraction y linearly polarised in \hat{x} , \hat{y} direction

"How much more momentum of transversely polarized particle carried by gluons aligned rather than perpendicular to it in the transverse plane"

Moments of $\Delta(x,Q^2)$ are calculable in LQCD



Determined by matrix elements of local gluonic operators

Symmetrize and trace subtract in
$$\mu_1, \dots, \mu_n$$

 $\langle pE' | \underline{S} \left[G_{\mu\mu_1} \overleftrightarrow{D}_{\mu_3} \dots \overleftrightarrow{D}_{\mu_n} G_{\nu\mu_2} \right] | pE \rangle$ Symmetrize and trace subtract in μ_1, \dots, μ_n
 $= (-2i)^{n-2} \underline{S} \left[(p_\mu E'^*_{\mu_1} - p_{\mu_1} E'^*_{\mu}) (p_\nu E_{\mu_2} - p_{\mu_2} E_{\nu}) + (\mu \leftrightarrow \nu) \right] p_{\mu_3} \dots p_{\mu_n} A_n (Q^2) \dots,$

Reduced Matrix Element

First LQCD calculation [W Detmold & PES PRD 94 (2016), 014507]

- First moment in φ meson (simplest spin-1 system, eventually \rightarrow nuclei)
- Lattice details: clover fermions, Lüscher-Weisz gauge action

L/a	T/a	eta	am_l	am_s
24	64	6.1	-0.2800	-0.2450
<i>a</i> (fm)	L (fm)	T (fm)	m_π (MeV)	m_K (MeV)
0.1167(16)	2.801(29)	7.469(77)	450(5)	596(6)
m_{ϕ} (MeV)	$m_{\pi}L$	$m_{\pi}T$	$N_{ m cfg}$	$N_{ m src}$
1040(3)	6.390	17.04	1042	10^{5}

- Many systematics not addressed (yet)!
 - Quark mass effects
 Discretisation
 - Volume effects

Renormalisation

Calculate lowest moment of $\Delta(x,Q^2)$:



Ratio of LQCD correlators $R_{jk}(t, \tau, \vec{p})$:



Calculate lowest moment of $\Delta(x,Q^2)$:



Ratio of LQCD correlators $R_{jk}(t, \tau, \vec{p})$:



More specifically,

$$\begin{split} C^{3\text{pt}}_{jk}(t,\tau,\vec{p}) &= \sum_{\vec{x}} \sum_{\vec{y}} e^{i\vec{p}\cdot\vec{x}} \langle \eta_j(t,\vec{p}) \ \mathcal{O}(\tau,\vec{y}) \ \eta^{\dagger}_k(0,\vec{0}) \rangle \\ &= Z_{\phi} e^{-Et} \sum_{\lambda\lambda'} \epsilon^{(E)}_j(\vec{p},\lambda) \epsilon^{(E)*}_k(\vec{p},\lambda') \langle \vec{p},\lambda | \mathcal{O} | \vec{p},\lambda' \rangle \end{split}$$

$$C_{jk}^{2\text{pt}}(t,\vec{p}) = \sum_{\vec{x}} e^{i\vec{p}\cdot\vec{x}} \langle \eta_j(t,\vec{x})\eta_k^{\dagger}(0,\vec{0}) \rangle$$
$$= Z_{\phi} \left(e^{-Et} + e^{-E(T-t)} \right) \sum_{\lambda\lambda'} \epsilon_j^{(E)}(\vec{p},\lambda) \epsilon_k^{(E)*}(\vec{p},\lambda')$$

ratio depends on polarisations, momentum

$$R_{jk}(t,\tau,\vec{p}) = \frac{C_{jk}^{3\text{pt}}(t,\tau,\vec{p}) + C_{jk}^{3\text{pt}}(T-t,T-\tau,\vec{p})}{C_{jk}^{2\text{pt}}(t,\vec{p})}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \epsilon^{\mu}(\vec{p},\lambda) &= \left(\frac{\vec{p}\cdot\vec{e}_{\lambda}}{m},\vec{e}_{\lambda} + \frac{\vec{p}\cdot\vec{e}_{\lambda}}{m(m+E)}\vec{p}\right) \\ \vec{e}_{\pm} &= \mp \frac{m}{\sqrt{2}}(0,1,\pm i), \\ \vec{e}_{0} &= m(1,0,0). \end{aligned}$$

More specifically,

$$C_{jk}^{3\text{pt}}(t,\tau,\vec{p}) = \sum_{\vec{x}} \sum_{\vec{y}} e^{i\vec{p}\cdot\vec{x}} \langle \eta_j(t,\vec{p}) \ \mathcal{O}(\tau,\vec{y}) \ \eta_k^{\dagger}(0,\vec{0}) \rangle$$
$$= Z_{\phi} e^{-Et} \sum_{\lambda\lambda'} \epsilon_j^{(E)}(\vec{p},\lambda) \epsilon_k^{(E)*}(\vec{p},\lambda') \langle \vec{p},\lambda| \mathcal{O} | \vec{p},\lambda' \rangle$$

$$C_{jk}^{2\text{pt}}(t,\vec{p}) = \sum_{\vec{x}} e^{i\vec{p}\cdot\vec{x}} \langle \eta_j(t,\vec{x})\eta_k^{\dagger}(0,\vec{0}) \rangle$$
$$= Z_{\phi} \left(e^{-Et} + e^{-E(T-t)} \right) \sum_{\lambda\lambda'} \epsilon_j^{(E)}(\vec{p},\lambda) \epsilon_k^{(E)*}(\vec{p},\lambda')$$

ratio depends on polarisations, momentum

$$R_{jk}(t,\tau,\vec{p}) = \frac{C_{jk}^{3\text{pt}}(t,\tau,\vec{p}) + C_{jk}^{3\text{pt}}(T-t,T-\tau,\vec{p})}{C_{jk}^{2\text{pt}}(t,\vec{p})}$$

- All polarisation combinations (j,k)
- Boost momenta up to (I,I,I)
- Examine all elements of each hypercubic irrep.

$$\begin{aligned} \epsilon^{\mu}(\vec{p},\lambda) &= \left(\frac{\vec{p}\cdot\vec{e}_{\lambda}}{m},\vec{e}_{\lambda} + \frac{\vec{p}\cdot\vec{e}_{\lambda}}{m(m+E)}\vec{p}\right) \\ \vec{e}_{\pm} &= \mp \frac{m}{\sqrt{2}}(0,1,\pm i), \\ \vec{e}_{0} &= m(1,0,0). \end{aligned}$$

Ratio of correlation functions determines reduced matrix elt.



Ratio of correlation functions determines reduced matrix elt.

p=(0,0,0)

p=(I,I,I) (lattice units)

























Gluonic Radii

Off-forward matrix elements are complicated

Eg: moments of $\Delta(x,Q^2)$ related to many form factors $\left\langle p'E' \left| S \left[G_{\mu\mu_1} \overset{\leftrightarrow}{D}_{\mu_3} \dots \overset{\leftrightarrow}{D}_{\mu_n} G_{\nu\mu_2} \right] \right| pE \right\rangle$ $= \sum_{n=1} \left\{ A_{1,m-3}^{(n)}(t,\mu^2) S\left[(P_{\mu}E_{\mu_1} - E_{\mu}P_{\mu_1})(P_{\nu}E_{\mu_2}^{\prime*} - E_{\nu}^{\prime*}P_{\mu_2})\Delta_{\mu_3} \dots \Delta_{\mu_{m-1}}P_{\mu_m} \dots P_{\mu_n} \right] \right\}$ $+ A_{2,m-3}^{(n)}(t,\mu^2) S\left[(\Delta_{\mu} E_{\mu_1} - E_{\mu} \Delta_{\mu_1}) (\Delta_{\nu} E_{\mu_2}^{\prime*} - E_{\nu}^{\prime*} \Delta_{\mu_2}) \Delta_{\mu_3} \dots \Delta_{\mu_{m-1}} P_{\mu_m} \dots P_{\mu_n} \right]$ $+A_{3,m-3}^{(n)}(t,\mu^2)S\left[\left((\Delta_{\mu}E_{\mu_1}-E_{\mu}\Delta_{\mu_1})(P_{\nu}E_{\mu_2}^{\prime*}-E_{\nu}^{\prime*}P_{\mu_2})-(\Delta_{\mu}E_{\mu_1}^{\prime*}-E_{\mu}^{\prime*}\Delta_{\mu_1})(P_{\nu}E_{\mu_2}-E_{\nu}P_{\mu_2})\right)\right]$ $\times \Delta_{\mu_3} \dots \Delta_{\mu_{m-1}} P_{\mu_m} \dots P_{\mu_n}$ + $A_{4,m-3}^{(n)}(t,\mu^2) S \left[(E_{\mu}E_{\mu_1}^{\prime*} - E_{\mu_1}E_{\mu}^{\prime*})(P_{\nu}\Delta_{\mu_2} - P_{\mu_2}\Delta_{\nu})\Delta_{\mu_3}\dots\Delta_{\mu_{m-1}}P_{\mu_m}\dots P_{\mu_n} \right]$ $+\frac{A_{5,m-3}^{(n)}(t,\mu^2)}{M^2}S\left[\left((E\cdot P)(P_{\mu}\Delta_{\mu_1}-\Delta_{\mu}P_{\mu_1})(\Delta_{\nu}E_{\mu_2}^{\prime*}-E_{\nu}^{\prime*}\Delta_{\mu_2})\right]\right]$ + $(E'^* \cdot P)(P_{\mu}\Delta_{\mu_1} - \Delta_{\mu}P_{\mu_1})(\Delta_{\nu}E_{\mu_2} - E_{\nu}\Delta_{\mu_2}))\Delta_{\mu_3}\dots\Delta_{\mu_{m-1}}P_{\mu_m}\dots P_{\mu_n}]$ $+\frac{A_{6,m-3}^{(n)}(t,\mu^2)}{M^2}S\left[\left((E\cdot P)(P_{\mu}\Delta_{\mu_1}-\Delta_{\mu}P_{\mu_1})(P_{\nu}E_{\mu_2}^{\prime*}-E_{\nu}^{\prime*}P_{\mu_2})\right)\right]$ $- (E'^* \cdot P) (P_{\mu} \Delta_{\mu_1} - \Delta_{\mu} P_{\mu_1}) (P_{\nu} E_{\mu_2} - E_{\nu} P_{\mu_2})) \Delta_{\mu_3} \dots \Delta_{\mu_{m-1}} P_{\mu_m} \dots P_{\mu_n}]$ $+\frac{A_{7,m-3}^{(n)}(t,\mu^2)}{M^2}(E'^*\cdot E)S\left[(P_{\mu}\Delta_{\mu_1}-\Delta_{\mu}P_{\mu_1})(P_{\nu}\Delta_{\mu_2}-\Delta_{\nu}P_{\mu_2})\Delta_{\mu_3}\dots\Delta_{\mu_{m-1}}P_{\mu_m}\dots P_{\mu_n}\right]$ $+\frac{A_{8,m-3}^{(n)}(t,\mu^2)}{M4}(E\cdot P)(E^{\prime*}\cdot P)S\left[(P_{\mu}\Delta_{\mu_1}-\Delta_{\mu}P_{\mu_1})(P_{\nu}\Delta_{\mu_2}-\Delta_{\nu}P_{\mu_2})\Delta_{\mu_3}\dots\Delta_{\mu_{m-1}}P_{\mu_m}\dots P_{\mu_n}\right]\Big\}$

Gluonic Radii

Off-forward matrix elements are complicated

Eg: moments of $\Delta(x,Q^2)$ related to many form factors $\left\langle p'E' \left| S \left[G_{\mu\mu_1} \overset{\leftrightarrow}{D}_{\mu_3} \dots \overset{\leftrightarrow}{D}_{\mu_n} G_{\nu\mu_2} \right] \right| pE \right\rangle$ $=\sum_{\substack{m \text{ odd} \\ m=3}} \left\{ A_{1,m-3}^{(n)}(t,\mu^2) S \left[(P_{\mu}E_{\mu_1} - E_{\mu}P_{\mu_1})(P_{\nu}E_{\mu_2}^{\prime*} - E_{\nu}^{\prime*}P_{\mu_2}) \Delta_{\mu_3} \dots \Delta_{\mu_{m-1}}P_{\mu_m} \dots P_{\mu_n} \right] \right\}$ + $A_{2,m-3}^{(n)}(t,\mu^2) S \left[(\Delta_{\mu} E_{\mu_1} - E_{\mu} \Delta_{\mu_1}) (\Delta_{\nu} E_{\mu_2}^{\prime*} - E_{\nu}^{\prime*} \Delta_{\mu_2}) \Delta_{\mu_3} \dots \Delta_{\mu_{m-1}} P_{\mu_m} \dots P_{\mu_n} \right]$ $(E'^* - E'^* \Lambda_{...})(P_{..}E_{...} - E_{\nu}P_{\mu_2})$ $_{-3}(t,\mu)$ Many gluonic radii: $+ A^{(n)}_{4,m-3}(t,\mu^2) S$ Defined by slope of each + $\frac{A_{5,m-3}^{(n)}(t,\mu^2)}{M^2}S [((E \cdot P)(P_{\mu}\Delta_{\mu}))]$ form factor at Q²=t=0 $+ (E'^* \cdot P)(P_\mu$ P_{μ_n}] $+\frac{A_{6,m-3}^{(n)}(t,\mu^2)}{M^2}S\left[((P \cdot P)(P_{\mu})_{\mu_1} - \Delta_{\mu}P_{\mu_1})(P_{\nu}E_{\mu_2}'^* - E_{\nu}'^*P_{\mu_2})\right]$ $+ \frac{A_{7,m-3}^{(n)}(t,\mu^2)}{M^2} (E'^* E) S \left[(P_{\mu}\Delta_{\mu_1} - \Delta_{\mu}P_{\mu_1})(P_{\nu}\Delta_{\mu_2} - E_{\nu}P_{\mu_2}) \Delta_{\mu_3} \dots \Delta_{\mu_{m-1}}P_{\mu_m} \dots P_{\mu_n} \right]$ $+\frac{A_{8,m-3}^{(n)}(t,\mu^2)}{M^4}(E\cdot P)(E'^*\cdot P)S\left[(P_{\mu}\Delta_{\mu_1}-\Delta_{\mu}P_{\mu_1})(P_{\nu}\Delta_{\mu_2}-\Delta_{\nu}P_{\mu_2})\Delta_{\mu_3}\dots\Delta_{\mu_{m-1}}P_{\mu_m}\dots P_{\mu_n}\right]\Big\}$

Gluonic Radii



Gluonic Structure circa 2025

- Electron-Ion collider will dramatically alter our knowledge of the gluonic structure of hadrons and nuclei
 - Work towards a complete 3D picture of parton structure (PDFs, GPDs, TMDs)
 - $\Delta(x,Q^2)$ has an interesting role
 - Purely gluonic
 - Non-nucleonic: directly probe nuclear effects



- Compare quark and gluon distributions in hadrons and nuclei
- Lattice QCD calculations in hadrons and light nuclei will be available